Tennessee State University Board of Trustees

AUDIT COMMITTEE REPORT

TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY BOARD OF TRUSTEES AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

10:00 a.m. CST Thursday, November 19, 2020 Tennessee State University – Board Committee Meeting: Via Zoom Link:

ORDER OF BUSINESS

- I. Call to Order
- II. Roll Call/Declaration of a Quorum
- III. Approval of the September 24, 2020, Audit Committee Meeting Minutes
- IV. Report of Completed Internal and External Audits
- V. Review of Outstanding Audit Issues
- VI. Executive Session Discussion of Items Deemed Confidential Under State Law

Tennessee State University Board of Trustees

Approval of September 24, 2020, Audit Committee Meeting Minutes

TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY **BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

ACTION ITEM

DATE:

November 19, 2020

ITEM:

Audit Committee Report - Approval of the September 24, 2020,

Audit Committee Meeting Minutes

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approval

PRESENTED BY:

Chair of Audit Committee, Trustee Deborah Cole

The document reflecting the minutes from the September 24, 2020, Audit Committee meeting is included in the November 19, 2020, Board materials.

MOTION: To approve the September 24, 2020, Audit Committee meeting minutes, as contained in the November 19, 2020, Board materials.

Meeting of the Tennessee State University Board of Trustees Audit Committee Meeting September 24, 2020 Tennessee State University – Electronic

MINUTES

Committee Members Present: Trustees Deborah Cole, Obie McKenzie and Richard Lewis;

Other Board Members Present: Joseph W. Walker, III, Pam Martin, Andre Johnson, Steve Corbeil, Dr. Ali Sekmen, and Tiara Thomas.

Board and University Staff Present: President Glenda Glover; Laurence Pendleton, General Counsel and Board Secretary; Dr. Michael Harris, Interim Provost & Vice President for Academic Affairs; Dr. Curtis Johnson, Chief of Staff; Dean Frank Stevenson, Assoc. Vice President of Student Affairs; Horace Chase, Vice President of Business and Finance; Dr. Frances Williams, Assoc. Vice President of Research & Sponsored Programs; and Terrence Izzard, Assoc. Vice President of Enrollment Management; Adrian Davis, Director of Internal Audit.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Trustee Cole called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m. on September 24, 2020. Trustee Cole moved to make certain findings on the record regarding the necessity for conducting the meeting electronically without a physical quorum present due to the coronavirus pandemic. The Committee found that there were various important matters that required immediate action by the Committee. Participation by electronic means was necessitated by the COVID-19 pandemic and accompanying guidance from the Center for Disease Control ("CDC") and the State of Tennessee to enforce social distancing guidelines, including limiting face-to-face contact whenever possible. Electronic participation for the Committee meeting was necessary for the safety of Board members, staff, and guests. Trustee Lewis seconded and the motion carried.

II. ROLL CALL/DECLARATION OF A QUORUM

Trustee Cole asked the secretary to the board to call the role. Board Secretary Pendleton called the roll. Present: Trustees Deborah Cole, Richard Lewis, and Obie McKenzie. A quorum was established.

Trustee Cole asked the Committee members to state now if any of the committee members cannot hear or speak with each other. No committee members answered in the affirmative. Trustee Cole also asked the committee members to indicate if someone is present with them from the location in which they are calling. No committee members indicated there was anyone present.

III. APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 18, 2020, AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Trustee Cole moved to recommend to the full Board the approval of the minutes from the June 18, 2020, Audit committee meeting, as contained in the September 24, 2020, board materials. Trustee McKenzie seconded the motion, which carried unanimously by roll call vote.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE FISCAL YEAR 2020/2021 REVISED AUDIT PLAN Trustee Cole asked President Glover and Director of Internal Audit, Ms. Adrian Davis, to provide pertinent information related to this agenda item.

Ms. Davis discussed the fiscal year 2020-2021 revised audit plan as included in the September 24, 2020 board meeting materials. She reminded the committee that this plan was already submitted and approved at the last Board of Trustees meeting held in June, 2020. She noted that at that presentation, Trustee Cole pointed out that the date on her report needed updating and also internal audit follow-ups on findings needed to be included in the plan. Ms. Davis indicated that both requests had been satisfied with this revision.

Trustee Cole then moved to recommend to the full Board the approval of the fiscal year 2020-2021 revised audit plan as contained in the September 24, 2020, board materials. Trustee McKenzie seconded the motion, which carried unanimously by roll call vote: Cole, Lewis, and McKenzie.

V. REPORT OF COMPLETED INTERNAL AUDITS

Trustee Cole asked President Glover and Director of Internal Audit, Ms. Adrian Davis, to provide pertinent information related to this agenda item. The material is included in the September 24, 2020, Board Meeting packet.

Ms. Davis stated that in conducting the internal audit on the expenditures for fiscal year 2020 on the NCAA Student Assistance Fund (SAF), a discrepancy was found. The noted expense in the amount of \$13,914.00 paid to two students during fall 2019 and spring 2020, pertaining to student-athletes tutoring services, though correctly reported on the SAF Report as tutoring expenses, were erroneously applied to the students' accounts as scholarships. It was recommended that these students be paid as vendors through the university's purchasing system. The department responded that it will work to ensure that all recommendations are met.

Trustee Cole suggested to Ms. Davis that the audit office follow up to ensure that these corrections are made. She then thanked Ms. Davis for the report.

VI. REVIEW OF OUTSTANDING AUDIT ISSUES

Trustee Cole asked President Glover to provide pertinent information related to this agenda item. The material is included in the September 24, 2020, Board Meeting packet.

Ms. Davis discussed the list of outstanding internal audit issues as of September 3, 2020 as included in the Board Meeting packet. She pointed out that the list of external outstanding issues was received too late for inclusion into this meeting's agenda. The findings will be openly discussed at the next Board of Trustees meeting.

With no questions or comments, Trustee Cole moved to recommend to the full Board the motion to adjourn the meeting to enter into Executive Session. Trustee McKenzie seconded the motion, which carried unanimously by roll call vote: Cole, Lewis, and McKenzie.

VII. EXECUTIVE SESSION FOR DISCUSSION OF ITEMS DEEMED CONFIDENTIAL UNDER STATE LAW

Trustee Cole moved for the Audit Committee to go into Executive Session to discuss items deemed confidential under State law. Trustees McKenzie and Lewis seconded the motion, which was carried unanimously by roll call vote. The committee then transitioned into the executive session.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

There was no further discussion. Trustee Cole moved to adjourn the meeting and the motion was seconded by Trustee McKenzie. The motion carried unanimously by roll call vote. The meeting was adjourned at 12:09 pm.

Tennessee State University Board of Trustees

Review of Completed Internal and External Audits

TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

INFORMATION ITEM

DATE: November 19, 2020

ITEM: Audit Committee Report – Review of Completed Internal

and External Audits

RECOMMENDED ACTION: None

PRESENTED BY: Chair of Audit Committee, Trustee Deborah Cole

Background Information:

The results of audits completed by the Tennessee State University Department of Internal Audit will be discussed. In addition, the *Tennessee Comptroller of the Treasury- Division of State Audit* conducted simultaneous audits of the financial statements and accompanying notes to the financial statements of Tennessee State University and the Endowment for Educational Excellence at the TSU Foundation. The audits covered the fiscal year ended June 30, 2018. The details of these audits will be discussed.

DEPARTMENT OF INTERNAL AUDIT

Follow-Up Review of Undergraduate Admissions for Fall 2020 Semester

Table of Contents

Transmittal Letter	2
Executive Summary	3
Introduction	3
Objective	3
Scope	3
Current Status of Prior Audit Findings	3
Conclusion	4
Prior Audit Recommendations & Management's Response	5
Prior Audit Findings and Current Status	7



October 21, 2020

Dr. Glenda Baskin Glover, President Tennessee State University 3500 John A. Merritt Boulevard Nashville, Tennessee 37209

Dear Dr. Glover:

Enclosed is the internal audit report related to our follow-up review of the Tennessee State University Office of Enrollment Management's adherence to state and institutional student admission policies and procedures. The scope of the follow-up review included newly admitted and readmitted undergraduate students during the fall 2020 semester. The audit was performed in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing, issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors.

The results of our review are included in the attached report.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation of institution personnel during the review.

Sincerely,

Adrian R. Davis

Adrian R. Davis, CPA, CGFM Director of Internal Audit Tennessee State University

CC:

Dr. Deborah A. Cole, Tennessee State University Audit Committee Chair Mr. Terrence Izzard, Associate Vice President of Admissions and Recruitment

Tennessee State University Department of Internal Audit Follow-Up Audit of Admissions Fall 2020 Executive Summary

Key Area	Undergraduate Student Internal Adrian R. Davis, CPA, CGFM Admissions Auditor Director of Internal Audit
Introduction	Attracting and attaining qualified students is an essential element of effective recruitment and admissions and university success. The Department of Admissions and Recruitment is one of the departments in the university's Division of Enrollment Management and Student Success. The Department of Admissions' primary functions is the processing of prospective student admissions applications and obtaining supporting documentation to support the admissions decisions made. University management ensures confidence in its admissions process by adhering to its admission policies, rules, regulations, and procedures.
Objective	The Tennessee State University Office of Internal Audit performed an audit of the undergraduate admissions process to determine if the university was in compliance with state and institutional policies and procedures related to student enrollment for the fall 2019 semester. The results of that audit included four audit findings. The objective of this audit was to determine whether management has implemented adequate corrective actions to address the four prior audit findings.
Scope	Undergraduate students (newly admitted and readmitted) enrolled during the fall 2020 semester
Current Status of Prior Audit Findings	 Prior Audit Finding: University policy allows for the admission of conditionally admitted (students not meeting all admissions requirements) first-time freshmen students. The number of these students is not to exceed 10% of the first-time freshmen students admitted during a given semester. During the fall 2019 semester, management accepted 21.5% of conditional admits, exceeding the 10% limit by 11.5%. Current Status: Corrected. Prior Audit Finding: Management in the Division of Enrollment Management and Student Success did not ensure that proper supporting documentation (final transcripts after high school graduation, test scores, etc). was obtained for all enrolled students. Current Status: Corrected (First-Time Freshmen) Improved, Not Corrected (Dual Enrollment). Prior Audit Finding: Management in the Division of Enrollment Management and Student Success did not ensure that admission policies addressed exceptions to the initial sequence of the collection of the properties of students (o.g., Dual Enrollment and Enrollme
	admission requirements for all categories of students (e.g. Dual Enrollment and Readmitted students). * Current Status: Corrected. 4. Prior Audit Finding: Management did not ensure adherence to the state laws requiring newly admitted and readmitted full-time students and those who reside in student housing to provide valid proof of certain immunizations, or valid support for exemption, prior to residing in student housing or being enrolled full-time in a Tennessee higher education institution.

	❖ Current Status: Not Corrected.
Conclusion	The objective of our audit was met. It was determined that management has implemented adequate corrective actions to implement the previous audit recommendations and address the audit findings, except as noted above.
Restriction on Use of Report	This report is intended solely for the internal use of Tennessee State University (TSU) and the Tennessee State University Audit Committee, a standing committee of the Tennessee State University Board of Trustees. It is not intended to be and should not be used for any other purpose. The distribution of the report to external parties must be approved by the TSU Audit Committee and Tennessee State University Office of Internal Audit, and handled in accordance with institutional policies; however, this report is a matter of public record.

Prior Audit Recommendations and Management's Response

Audit Recommendation 1:

Management in the Division of Enrollment Management and Success should:

- a. Develop procedures that help to ensure all personnel involved in the review and approval/denial of prospective student applications are obtaining required supporting documentation to support the decision;
- b. Ensure that admission exception thresholds are not exceeded, unless allowable per policy; and
- c. Ensure that criteria for any exceptions to the admissions policies are transparent and documented

Management's Response:

Many of the issues cited in this report were the result of inefficient admissions processing personnel, poor supervision of daily operations under the former Director of Admissions, coupled with several technical challenges with our Banner Document Management System (BDMS). To address the issues noted in this report:

- We have hired new management, and admissions processing personnel. Inefficient personnel in this area were relieved of their duties.
- The Office of Admissions has automated document management services for incoming supporting documents allowing them to be directly attached to the student record. This eliminates the previous manual practice of scanning and indexing.
- We have implemented a new "Quality Assurance" check process policy to prevent recurrence of several of the issues noted above
- For the students identified as not having an official final transcript on file, we have placed a hold on each student's account and have requested a copy of the final high school transcripts.

An exception to the ACT/SAT score requirement was given to dual enrollment students on the basis of their high GPA scores and pending schedules to take the ACT exam.

Audit Recommendation 2:

Per discussion with previous management personnel in charge of *First-Year Students* during the fall 2019 semester, the six students determined not to have provided health records were registered to attend a 2019 New Student Orientation summer session. They were registered for courses through a process called block scheduling prior to their New Student Orientation session. Block scheduling allows the university to mass register large amounts of students who attend the New Student Orientation sessions while ensuring they are registered for 15+ credit hours in the first semester to support student progression. The process also allows staff to override immunization requirements. Students attending the session are asked to complete the Fall 2019 Registration Agreement Form where they (and their guardian, if applicable) acknowledge that although they are registered for courses, required documentation (health records, final transcripts, etc.) is still due for submission by August 1st to maintain registration throughout the upcoming semester.

Current management of *First-Year Students* should ensure that they communicate with the university's Office of Student Health Services (responsible for collecting the forms) to ensure that these block scheduled students have a hold placed on their account until the appropriate health forms are obtained. The students should also be included in purge lists when required information is not provided.

Prior Audit Findings and Current Status

1. New/First-Time Freshmen

A. Prior Audit Finding:

The university's policy states that 10% of the total number of first-time freshmen admitted in any given term can be conditionally admitted. Conditionally admitted students are those students that have completed all required high school units but did not meet the university's minimum 2.50 grade point average (GPA) and/or minimum test score requirement (ACT 19/SAT 900). We identified 4,711 approved applications for prospective first-time freshmen. The total number of conditional admits should have been 471 students according to university policy. It was determined that 1,016 (or 21.5%) of the accepted students did not meet the university's admission requirements. The university exceeded the allowed acceptance limit for conditional admits by 545 students (or 11.5%). The average grade point average for the 1,016 students was determined to be 2.52.

- 41 of the 1,016 students did not meet the university's GPA requirement
- 910 of the 1,016 students did not meet the university's score requirement
- 65 of the 1,016 students did not meet either requirement (GPA or score)

Current Status: Corrected

**Tennessee State University waived the ACT/SAT score requirement for first-time students for the Fall 2020 semester in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. For this reason, conditional admits during the fall 2020 semester included only those students who did not meet the minimum GPA requirement.

✓ We identified 5,436 approved applications for prospective first-time freshmen students during the fall 2020 semester. We found where 110 of these 5,436 approved applicants (2.02%) did not meet the minimum 2.50 GPA admission requirement and qualified as conditional admits. It was determined that this 2.02% acceptance rate is in agreement with the university's conditional admit policy.

B. Prior Audit Finding:

It was determined that the university did not obtain the official transcript after high school graduation for 5 of the 40 students (12.5%) selected for testing

Current Status: Corrected

We selected 40 new/first-time freshmen students for testing.

- ✓ We found where the university obtained the official transcript after high school graduation for 37 of the 40 students tested. For the 3 students whose final transcript had not been submitted, we found where management admitted the students as 'tentatively admitted' and appropriately applied holds to the students' accounts at the time of acceptance. The hold prevents the students from registering for future semesters until the required document is provided.
 - o Management obtained 2 of the 3 outstanding transcripts during our testing.

C. Prior Audit Finding:

State law requires new and readmitted full-time students and those living in student housing to provide proof of certain immunizations or acceptable proof of exemption from receiving the immunization(s). It was determined that the university did not obtain immunization support for 6 of the 40 students (15%) selected for testing.

Current Status: Not corrected

For the 40 new/first-time freshmen students selected for testing:

- The Office of Student Health Services did not obtain required immunization history documentation for 6 of the 29 students (20.7%) required to submit immunization documentation. The remaining 11 students were not required to submit immunization documentation because they were not enrolled full-time (1 student) or were enrolled 100% online (12 students) and did not reside in a residential hall.
 - 4 of the 6 students took online courses with 1 hybrid course preventing them from being 100% online
 - 1 of the 6 students resided in student housing and no meningitis vaccination verification was obtained. The university obtained all other vaccination history documentation for the student.
 - o 1 of the 6 students took 3 conventional courses and 3 hybrid courses

**We will perform further follow-up procedures to determine if management collects required immunization documentation for the spring 2021 semester.

2. Dual enrollment

Prior Audit Findings:

- o For 32 of the 40 dual enrollment students (80%) tested who were under the age of 18, we were not provided with supporting documentation to show that the university obtained supporting documentation of parental permission for the student to participate in the program.
- For 2 of the 40 students (5%) selected for testing, it was determined that the students did not meet the minimum grade point average required for participation in the program. The two students' GPA was 1.82 and 1.83.
- Participants are required to take the ACT or SAT test in order to participate in the program.
 For 11 of the 40 students (27.5%) selected for testing, it was determined that the university did not obtain proof that the students took either of the required tests.

Current Status: Improved, but Not Corrected

- ❖ For 8 of 20 dual enrollment students (40%) under the age of 18 and selected for testing:
 - We were not provided with signed consent forms for 3 of these 8 students
 - The consent form did not include the signature of the student's parent/guardian for 4 of these 8 students
 - The consent form was signed after it was requested by auditors for 1 of these students
- ❖ We reviewed the GPA for the 209 dual enrolled students during the fall 2020 semester. For the 10 students who did not meet the minimum grade point average, management advised us that these students were allowed to enroll as part of the *Tennessee State University Aspiring Scholars Program* (TASP). It was determined that these 10 students' GPA was not materially different from admissions requirements. Differences ranged from .07 to .25 below the minimum required grade point average.
 - Management did not provide the high school transcript for 1 of the 209 enrolled dual enrollment students so we were unable to verify the student's GPA

- ❖ Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, students were not required to submit ACT/SAT scores.
 - **We will perform further follow-up procedures to determine if management collects required documentation for dual enrollment students during the spring 2021 semester.

3. Re-admitted Students

Prior Audit Finding:

For 1 of 25 students (4%) selected for testing, it was determined that the student did not meet the minimum grade point average required for admission for the number of credit hours attempted.

Current Status: Corrected

✓ All 25 students selected for testing met the minimum required grade point average required for admission.

DEPARTMENT OF INTERNAL AUDIT

Follow-Up Review of Graduate Admissions for Fall 2020 Semester

Table of Contents

Transmittal Letter	
Executive Summary	
Introduction	
Objective	
Scope	
Current Status of Prior Audit Findings	
Conclusion	
Prior Audit Recommendations & Management's Responses	
Prior Audit Findings and Current Status	



October 21, 2020

Dr. Glenda Baskin Glover, President Tennessee State University 3500 John A. Merritt Boulevard Nashville, Tennessee 37209

Dear Dr. Glover:

Enclosed is the internal audit report related to our follow-up review of the Tennessee State University Office of Graduate and Professional Studies' adherence to state and institutional student admission policies and procedures. The scope of the follow-up review included newly admitted and readmitted graduate students during the fall 2020 semester. The audit was performed in accordance with the *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*, issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors.

The results of our review are included in the attached report.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation of institution personnel during the review.

Sincerely,

Adrian R. Davis

Adrian R. Davis, *CPA*, *CGFM* Director of Internal Audit Tennessee State University

CC:

Dr. Deborah A. Cole, Tennessee State University Audit Committee Chair

Dr. Michael Harris, Interim Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs

Tennessee State University Department of Internal Audit Follow-Up Audit of Graduate Admissions Fall 2020 Executive Summary

Key Area	Graduate-Level Student	Internal	Adrian R. Davis, CPA, CGFM
	Admissions	Auditor	Director of Internal Audit
Introduction	recruitment and admissions and academic courses of study that bachelor's degree) in certain disc students for careers in specific fits admissions process by adher procedures.	university suc offer more a ciplines. Prof esields. University ing to its adm	is an essential element of effective ccess. Graduate school programs are dvanced programs of study (beyond a essional school programs help prepare sity management ensures confidence in mission policies, rules, regulations, and
Objective	audit of the grad Tennessee State University Offici if the university was in compliant related to student enrollment for included two audit findings. The management has implemented a recommendations to address the	uate adrive of Graduate ce with state a corthe fall 20 de objective of dequate corretwo prior auc	
Scope	semester		readmitted) enrolled during the fall 2020
Current Status of Prior Audit Finding	supporting documentation (e.g for official test scores, etc.) to suppose Current Status: Correct	final undergrant admission of the decimal deci	not always obtain and/or retain required aduate transcripts, student applications, decisions ment has implemented new policies and orting documentation is obtained and
	history records for applicable ne full-time enrollment during the f Current Status: Not Conot obtained for all applicable.	ewly admitted all 2019 seme prrected. Requested	uired immunization documentation was d students.
Conclusion	implemented adequate correct recommendations and address the	tive actions he audit findir	was determined that management has to implement the previous audit ags, except as noted above.
Restriction on Use of Report	State University Audit Committee, a s Trustees. It is not intended to be and si report to external parties must be a	tanding commit hould not be use approved by the ad handled in a	nessee State University (TSU) and the Tennessee tee of the Tennessee State University Board of the for any other purpose. The distribution of the TSU Audit Committee and Tennessee State eccordance with institutional policies; however,

Prior Audit Recommendations and Management's Responses

Audit Recommendation 1:

Management in the School of Graduate and Professional Studies should develop procedures that ensure that all required applicant data and supporting documentation (e.g., applications, final transcripts, official test scores, etc.) is obtained and retained for required periods.

Management's Response:

In order to ensure that the issues documented in this report do not occur in the future, the Office of Graduate and Professional Studies will immediately implement the following procedures:

> To ensure that the prospective student's final transcript is obtained, the Admission Letter sent to the applicable student will contain the following statement:

IMPORTANT NOTE: Your student account will have a HOLD entered the day after Late Registration -Schedule Adjustment - Drop/Add ends for the first semester that you are enrolling in courses. Open the link to the Academic Calendar http://www.tnstate.edu/academic_programs/academic_calendar.aspx to see the specific date. Your transcript is OFFICIAL only when the Name of the degree, Date the degree was conferred, and the Seal of the institution has been received in ___CAS. It is your responsibility to obtain an OFFICIAL transcript uploaded into the __CAS. Failure to meet this condition before the deadline for entering the HOLD results in you not being able to register for, and take, courses for the next semester.

➤ To ensure that the prospective student's (International and US applicants) official test scores (GRE/GMAT/MAT) are obtained, the Admission Letter sent to the applicable student will contain the following statement:

IMPORTANT NOTE: You have the entire first semester to take the required test and submit a qualifying score. Your student account will have a HOLD entered the last day of the semester. Open the link to the Academic Calendar http://www.tnstate.edu/academic programs/academic calendar.aspx to see the specific date. Your test score results are OFFICIAL only when the testing agency has uploaded the results in __CAS. It is your responsibility to request the OFFICIAL test results be uploaded into the __CAS. Failure to meet this condition before the deadline for entering the HOLD results in you not being able to register for, and take, courses for the next semester. In addition, a special note will also be included on the admission letter to state, "the Graduate School will work with the program coordinator to extend the required test score a second semester but only due to hardship beyond the student's control."

- When TSU alumni and/or TSU readmitted students return to take a single course or to reenter a degree or certificate program, the Graduate School will verify the TSU Alumni earned his/her degree and add a comment in the Banner system to that effect. For TSU readmitted students, the Graduate School will verify the TSU student has an official transcript on file, in the Banner Document Management System (BDMS) or the related CAS system, for any colleges/universities attended since their time away from the university, and add a comment in the Banner system to that effect.
- > The Graduate School plans to ensure applications are maintained on file for the requisite amount of time of five years. The enhanced plan includes the 'Axiom' crosswalk from the CASs to Banner to maintain the applications and all associated documentation.

Audit Recommendation 2:

Management at the university did not ensure that required immunization, or exemption from immunization, documentation was obtained for all newly admitted full-time students. Several students were allowed to register and remain enrolled in courses, although, required immunization (or exemption) documentation was not received. Management at the university should develop procedures to ensure that students not providing required immunization documentation are purged by the university's final drop/add date. However, state law does allow students to remain enrolled

at the university after having the first of two doses of required vaccinations if certain criteria are met by the university.

Management's Response:

The Banner System is designed to automatically place a HOLD on a student's account according to birthdate criteria and designation of course delivery (online vs. on-ground). The Graduate School and the TSU Health Services Office will work together to develop procedures that will ensure appropriate HOLDS remain on students accounts, preventing applicable students from registering for courses until required vaccination documentation has been provided. Students will be purged by the end of the Drop/Add semester date of attendance for noncompliance

Prior Audit Findings and Current Status

1. New/First-Time Graduate/Professional Students

D. Prior Audit Finding:

For 26 of 50 students (52%) selected for testing, it was determined that the university did not obtain all required supporting documentation to support the admissions decision.

- For 10 of these 26 students, the university did not obtain copies of the student's final undergraduate transcript, which supports the student being awarded an undergraduate degree and classification as a graduate student
- For 12 of these 26 students, the university did not obtain official test scores (e.g., GRE, GMAT) at the time of application submission or prior to the end of the fall 2019 semester, as required.
- o For 1 of these 26 students, the university did not obtain copies of the student's final undergraduate transcript or official test scores
- o For 3 of these 26 students, the university did not use an official transcript (in-progress or final) to determine the student's eligibility for admission

Current Status: Corrected

We selected 30 new/first-time graduate/professional students for testing.

- ✓ All students in the sample were admitted based on the submission of official transcripts
- ✓ For 3 of the 30 students whose final transcript had not been submitted by the purge date for the fall 2020 semester, we found where management appropriately applied holds to the students' accounts. The hold prevents the students from registering for future semesters until the required document is provided.
- ✓ The COVID-19 pandemic caused several university departments to waive test score requirements for incoming graduate students. For those students who did not receive a test score waiver, we found where management implemented the procedures indicated in its corrective action plan. Management included a note on the student's acceptance letter that the test score requirement must be met by the end of the student's first enrolled semester or the student will have a hold placed on their student account and be prevented from registering in the subsequent semester.
 - **We will perform further follow-up procedures to determine if appropriate holds are placed on the student's account if the COVID-19 pandemic does not prevent students from completing the test score requirement prior to the end of the fall 2020 semester.

E. Prior Audit Finding:

It was determined that the university did not obtain immunization support for 10 of the 40 students (25%) included in our sample who were required to submit the documentation. State law requires new and readmitted full-time students and those living in student housing to provide proof of certain immunizations or acceptable proof of exemption from receiving the immunization(s).

Current Status: Not corrected

For the 30 new/first-time graduate/professional students selected for testing: The Office of Student Health Services is responsible for the collection of student immunization history records.

- The office did not obtain required immunization history documentation for 2 of the 4 students (50%) required to submit immunization documentation
 - The remaining 26 students were not required to submit immunization documentation because they were not enrolled full-time (16 students) or were enrolled 100% online (10 students). In addition, these students did not reside in student housing.
 - **We will perform further follow-up procedures to determine if management collects required documentation during the spring 2021 semester.

2. New Special/Non-Degree

A. Prior Audit Finding:

For 10 of 25 students (40%) selected for testing, the university did not provide copies of the application for admission submitted by the related students. University policy requires applications for admissions for enrolled students be retained for a minimum of 5 years.

Current Status: Corrected

We selected 15 new/special non-degree graduate students for testing.

✓ We found that the university was in possession of applications for admission for all students included in our sample.

3. Re-admitted Students

A. Prior Audit Finding:

For 6 of 25 students (24%) selected for testing, the university did not provide copies of the application for admission submitted by the related students. University policy requires applications for admissions for enrolled students be retained for a minimum of 5 years.

Current Status: Corrected

We selected 10 re-admitted graduate/professional students for testing.

✓ We found that the university was in possession of applications for admission for all students included in our sample.

DEPARTMENT OF INTERNAL AUDIT

Audit of President's Expense Schedules for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2020



October 25, 2020

Dr. Deborah A. Cole, Audit Committee Chair Tennessee State University 3500 John A. Merritt Boulevard Nashville, Tennessee 37209

Dear Chairwoman Cole:

Enclosed is the internal audit report of the expenses of the Office of the President for Tennessee State University for the fiscal year July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020, as required by Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 49, Chapter 7, and Tennessee State University Policy 4:03:03:60. The objectives of the audit were to determine compliance with state statutes and institutional policies regarding expenses and to identify and report all expenses for the fiscal year that were made by, at the direction of or for the benefit of the president regardless of the funding source.

The audit revealed no significant statutory or policy violations, material omissions from the expense reports or deficiencies in internal controls.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation of institution personnel during the review.

Sincerely,

Adrian R. Davis

Adrian R. Davis, CPA, CGFM Director of Internal Audit Tennessee State University

CC:

Dr. Glenda Baskin Glover, President

Mr. Horace Chase, Vice President for Business and Finance

Tennessee State University Audit of President's Expenses For the Fiscal Year July 1, 2019 – June 30, 2020

	For the Fiscal Teal July				CEL
President	Dr. Glenda Baskin Glover	Internal Auditor		Davis, <i>CPA, C</i> Internal Audi	
Objectives	To comply with Tennessee Code And Policy 4:03:03:60, by performing and the fiscal year July 1, 2019 to June 2 institutional policies regarding expendirection of or for the benefit of the policies.	internal finand 30, 2020; to desses; and to iden	cial audit of t etermine comp ntify and repo	he Office of to bliance with s rt all expense	the President for state statutes and s made by, at the
Scope	The audit included all accounts und funded by institutional funds, foun necessary. The audit was conducted <i>Professional Practice of Internal A</i> included tests of the accounting renecessary.	dation funds of in accordance uditing, issued	or external so e with the <i>Inc</i> l by the Insti	ources and ot ternational St tute of Intern	her accounts as tandards for the al Auditors and
Analysis	The following is a summary by fundi of, or for the benefit of the preside expenses for the president's office du	ent, and (2) sa	lary and bene	efits and any	other operating
	President:	Institutional	Foundation	External	Total
	Salary and Benefits	\$ 384,933	S -	S -	\$ 384,933
	Discretionary Allowance	5,000	Ψ -	-	5,000
	Other Allowances (longevity)	700	-	-	700
	Salary, Benefits & Other Payments	390,633			390,633
	Travel (Schedule A) Business Meals and Hospitality	995	2.927	•	3,922
	(Schedule B)	25,772	22,108	37,012	84.892
	Other Expenses (Schedule C) President's Office:	47,313	4,807	-	52,120
	Salary and Benefits	275,499	-	-	275,499
	Other Expenses	8,811	-		8,811
	Total Expenses	S 749,023	\$ 29,842	\$ 37,012	\$ 815,877
	Additional Disclosures:				
	Discretionary Allowance – The Pro- Use of the allowance was not incompresident elected for it to be paid as	luded in tests	performed d		
	Athletic Tickets – The President w face value of the tickets totaled \$33	as provided tic ,640 and parki	kets to univer ng passes tota	rsity athletic e lled \$2,000 fo	events. The or the period.
	Housing – The President is provide	d the use of a	residence. Co	sts to maintai	in the home are
	paid by the university and totaled \$		period.		
		34,747 for the ludes the cost	_	ided, paid, or	

Questioned Costs	None	Recoveries	N/A
Conclusion	University for the fiscal year July 1 revealed no significant statutory or	, 2019 through policy violation ontrols. The su	office of the President for Tennessee State June 30, 2020 were achieved. The audit ns, material omissions from the expense applemental schedules included with this soffice.
Restriction on Use of Report	Trustees and Tennessee State University other purpose. The distribution of the	sity. It is not into e report to exte ite University (f the Tennessee State University Board of ended to be and should not be used for any rnal parties must be approved by the TSU Office of Internal Audit, and handled in report is a matter of public record.

Tennessee State University Schedule A- Travel Expenses for the President For the Period July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020

President's Budgetary Accounts

Description	Insti	itutional	Fo	undation	External	Sources	 Total
Conference fee for SACSCOC Annual Meeting	\$	550	\$	-	\$	-	\$ 550
President's assistant attendance at HBCU C2 Training		445		-		-	445
Travel to attend funeral of former Cabinet member		-		2,199		-	2,199
Travel to attend funeral of university student		-		728			728.00
Total Travel Expenses for the President	\$	995		2,927			\$ 3,922

Tennessee State University Schedule B- Business Meals & Hospitality for the President For the Period July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020

President's Budgetary Accounts

Description	Ins	titutional	Fo	undation_	Exter	nal Sources	Total
Aramark (President's Hospitality Account 2019-2020)	\$	-	\$	-	\$	37,012	\$ 37,012
Levy Restaurant at Nissan Stadium (Catering for suites							
-Tennessee Titans football games)		-		12,103		-	12,103
Aramark (University Holiday Celebration)		-		10,005		-	10,005
Levy Restaurant at Nissan Stadium (Catering for suites							
-Tennessee State University football games)		25,772		-		-	25,772
Total Business & Meals & Hospitality Expenses	\$	25,772	\$	22,108	\$	37,012	\$ 84,892

Tennessee State University Schedule C - Other Expenses for the President For the Period July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020

President's Budgetary Accounts

Description	Ins	titutional		Fou	indation		Total
Holmes Pest Control	\$	990	*	\$	-	\$	990
Johnson Controls Security Solutions		2,976	*		-		2,976
Lowe's Home Centers LLC (christmas lights on campus)		2			680		680
J Co. Lawn Care (Christmas lights and installation)		1,800	*		-		1,800
Ferguson Enterprises Inc (Water heater replacement)		1,457	*		1.5		1,457
Labor and equipment to replace AC unit		26,690	*			_	26,690
Miscelleneous supplies for President's home		-			75	*	75
Nashville Area Chamber of Commerce (membership dues)		2,500					2,500
Nashville Area Chamber of Commerce (partnership 2020 initiative)		10,000					10,000
Nashville Area Hispanic Chamber of Commerce (membership dues)		500					500
College Board (membership dues)		400				•	400
Joy's Flowers (Funeral sprays)		5			373		373
Marlan J Gary Funeral Home (Partial payment of student's funeral)		-			2,320		2,320
Carter's Family Florist (Funeral spray)		2			100		100
The Community Foundation of Middle Tennessee (membership dues)		~			500		500
Home Depot USA Inc (Christmas lights)					759	*	759
Total Other Expenses for the President	\$	47,313		\$	4,807	\$	52,120

^{*} Expense for the President's home

External Audits

Audit: Financial and Compliance audit of Tennessee State University

Date Issued: 09/21/2020

Completed By: Tennessee Office of the Comptroller, Division of State Audit

Audit Opinion: Unmodified (Financial Statements are presented, in all material respects, the respective financial position of Tennessee State University and its discretely presented component unit as of June 30, 2018; and the respective changes in financial position and, where applicable, cash flows thereof for the year then ended in accordance with accounting principles generally accepted in the United States of America.

Audit Findings:

- Finding 1 As noted in the prior three audits, management needs to improve procedures for preparing and reviewing financial statements
- Finding 2 As noted in the prior audit, the university and the university foundation's accounting records show more cash on hand than the bank statements show; this variance is again unexplained
- Finding 3 As noted in the prior audit, the university did not have adequate policies and procedures for the collection of accounts receivable
- Finding 4 As noted in the prior four audits, Tennessee State University did not provide adequate internal controls in one area

Audit: Financial and Compliance audit of the Endowment for Educational Excellence at the Tennessee State University Foundation

Date Issued: 09/21/2020

Completed By: Tennessee Office of the Comptroller, Division of State Audit

Audit Opinion: Unmodified (Financial Statements are presented, in all material respects, the respective financial position of Tennessee State University and its discretely presented component unit as of June 30, 2018; and the respective changes in financial position and, where applicable, cash flows thereof for the year then ended in accordance with accounting principles generally accepted in the United States of America.

Audit Finding: As noted in the prior two audits, management needs to improve procedures for preparing and reviewing financial statements

Tennessee State University Board of Trustees

Review Of Outstanding Audit Issues

TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY BOARD OF TRUSTEES

INFORMATION ITEM

DATE: November 19, 2020

ITEM: Audit Committee Report – Review of Outstanding Audit

Issues

RECOMMENDED ACTION: None

PRESENTED BY: Chair of Audit Committee, Trustee Deborah Cole

Background Information:

Tennessee State University is subject to audits by its internal audit department and external entities. The audits, reviews, etc. can result in findings that require corrective actions on the part of university management. The Tennessee State University Audit Committee is diligent in its commitment and responsibility to ensure university compliance. The Audit Committee requests quarterly updates on management's progress towards correcting issues cited in audit reports. The status of management's progress towards correcting outstanding issues will be discussed.

Tennessee State University Department of Internal Audit Audit Issues Outstanding as of October 26, 2020

Report Title: Equipment Inventory Confirmation

Report Date: November 16, 2019

Issues	Status
1. For 22 of 50 items selected for physical inspection, the related custodian did not ensure that	
the location of the item was updated on the equipment listing	*Follow-up audit
2. For 8 of 50 items selected for physical inspection, the related custodian did not ensure	to begin January 2021
that the equipment listing correctly displayed the item's serial number	

Report Title: Follow-up to Audit of Federal Grant: Promoting Best Management Practices in the Nursery Production

Systems for the Mid-South United States by Providing Planning and Technical Assistance

Report Date: January 24, 2020

Issues	Status
1. Management was not timely in submitting required federal reports - financial and	
performance reports	*Follow-up audit
2. Time and effort certifications were not prepared for all time charged to the grant during	in progress
the budget period	

Report Title: Follow-up to Audit of Federal Grant: Career Commitment and Retention in STEM: The Intersection of

Professional Identity and Career Management Skills in Minority and Women STEM Students

Report Date: January 24, 2020

Issues	Status
1. For the 14 of 27 students, we determined that the students performed FWS duties during	
scheduled class hours for at least one day during the months under review	*Follow-up audit
2. For 17 of the 60 timesheets selected for review, the students worked more than 20 hours	in progress
a week for at least one week while classes were in session.	

Report Title: Follow-Up Review of Federal Work-Study Timesheets

Report Date: February 24, 2020

Issues	Status
1. For the 14 of 27 students, we determined that the students performed FWS duties during	*Follow-up audit
	to begin January 2021
2. For 17 of the 60 timesheets selected for review, the students worked more than 20 hours	
a week for at least one week while classes were in session.	

Report Title: Follow-Up Audit of Undergraduate Admissions

Report Date: October 21, 2020

Issues	Status
1. Management exceeded the 10% limit for conditionally admitted first-time freshmen students	Corrected
2. Management did not ensure that supporting documentation (final high school transcript, test scores, etc.) was obtained for all enrolled students	Partially Corrected
3. Management did not ensure that required immunization support was obtained for all applicable enrolled students	Not Corrected
Management did not ensure that all exceptions to admission criteria were properly documented	Corrected

Report Title: Follow-Up Audit of Graduate Admissions

Report Date: October 21, 2020

Issues	<u>Status</u>
1. The university did not always obtain and/or retain required supporting documentation	Corrected
(e.g. final undergraduate transcripts, student applications, official test scores, etc.) to support	
admissions decisions	
2. The university did not always obtain required immunization history records for applicable	Not Corrected
newly admitted and readmitted students registered for full-time enrollment and/or residing in	
student housing	

Report Title: Financial and Compliance Audit of Tennessee State University

Report Date: September 21, 2020

Issues	Status
1. As noted in the prior three audits, management needs to improve procedures for	1. Management is preparing
preparing and reviewing financial statements	to submit the FY 2020
F	financial statements, with the
	assistance of an outside firm
2. As noted in the prior audit, the university and the university foundation's accounting records	2. Management plans to
show more cash on hand than the bank statements show; this variance is again unexplained	have bank reconciliations
	being prepared timely by
	December 31, 2020;
	Updated reconciliations will
	be used to identify the reason
	for previous variances
3. As noted in the prior audit, the university did not have adequate policies and procedures for	3. A revised policy will be
the collection of accounts receivable	submitted for approval on
	11/19/2020
4. As noted in the prior four audits, Tennessee State University did not provide adequate	4. Management continues to
internal controls in one area (details of this finding are confidential per state law)	improve controls

Report Title: Financial and Compliance Audit of the Endowment for Educational Excellence

at the Tennessee State University Foundation

Report Date: September 21, 2020

Issues	Status
1. As noted in the prior two audits, management needs to improve procedures for preparing	* Financial statements not
and reviewing financial statements	yet due;
	Management to ensure
	appropriate reviews of the
	unaudited financial statements
	and notes

Tennessee State University Board of Trustees

Executive Session –
Discussion of Items
Deemed Confidential
Under State Law

TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY BOARD OF TRUSTEES

ACTION ITEM

DATE: November 19, 2020

ITEM: Audit Committee Report – Executive Session. Discussion of

Items Deemed Confidential under State Law

RECOMMENDED ACTION: None

PRESENTED BY: Chair of Audit Committee, Trustee Deborah Cole

MOTION: To approve going into Executive Session to discuss items deemed confidential under State law.